

AN EXTENDED CORRECTION TO “COMBINATORIAL SCALAR CURVATURE AND RIGIDITY OF BALL PACKINGS,” (BY D. COOPER AND I. RIVIN).

IGOR RIVIN

ABSTRACT. It has been pointed out to the author by David Glickenstein that the proof of the (closely related) Lemmas 1.2 and 3.2 in [CR97] is incorrect. The statements of both Lemmas are correct, and the purpose of this note is to give a correct argument. The argument is of some interest in its own right.

INTRODUCTION

Let us first recall the setup of [CR97]. In that paper we study *conformal* simplices. These are simplices $T(r_1, r_2, r_3, r_4)$ in 3-dimensional spaces of constant curvature such that there are positive numbers r_1, r_2, r_3, r_4 , such that the length l_{ij} of the edge joining the i -th and the j -th vertex of the simplex is given by $l_{ij} = r_i + r_j$.

On the set of conformal simplices we define a function S , as follows:

$$S(r_1, r_2, r_3, r_4) = \begin{cases} \sum_{i=1}^4 r_i S_i & \text{for simplices in } \mathbb{E}^3, \\ 2\text{vol } T + \sum_{i=1}^4 r_i S_i & \text{for simplices in } \mathbb{H}^3, \end{cases}$$

where vol stands for the hyperbolic volume of the simplex, and S_i stands for the solid angle at the i -th vertex: if α_{ij} is the dihedral angle at the edge joining the i -th and the j -th vertices, then

$$(1) \quad S_i = -\pi + \sum_{j \neq i} \alpha_{ij}.$$

The key property of the function S is, as shown in [CR97], that

$$(2) \quad H(S)_{ij} = \frac{\partial^2 S}{\partial r_i \partial r_j} = \frac{\partial S_i}{\partial r_j},$$

Date: today.

1991 *Mathematics Subject Classification.* Primary 52C15, 57M50.

Key words and phrases. scalar curvature, ball packing, rigidity.

The author would like to thank David Glickenstein and Bennett Chow (both of UCSD Mathematics Department) for bringing the error to his attention.

where we use $H(S)$ to denote the Hessian matrix of S . Lemma 1.2 states that $H(S)$ is negative semi-definite for simplices in $\mathbb{E}^3$, with the zero direction spanned by the vector (r_1, r_2, r_3, r_4) , and corresponding to the rescaling deformation of the simplex. Lemma 3.2 states that $H(S)$ is negative definite for simplices in $\mathbb{H}^3$.

1. PROOFS OF THE LEMMAS

The proofs given in [CR97] work without modification when all the radii are equal ($r_1 = r_2 = r_3 = r_4$.) Since the set of all conformal simplices is connected (as shown in [CR97]), it suffices to show that the rank of $H(S)$ always equals 3 in the Euclidean case and 4 in the hyperbolic case. The proof will rest on the following observations:

- (a) Define a function R on the set of all simplices by

$$R(l_{12}, l_{13}, l_{14}, l_{23}, l_{24}, l_{34}) = \begin{cases} \sum_{i < j} l_{ij}(\pi - \alpha_{ij}), & \text{Euclidean,} \\ \sum_{i < j} l_{ij}(\pi - \alpha_{ij}) + 2\text{vol } T, & \text{hyperbolic.} \end{cases}$$

and define the map

$$i(r_1, r_2, r_3, r_4) = (r_1 + r_2, r_1 + r_3, r_1 + r_4, r_2 + r_3, r_2 + r_4, r_3 + r_4).$$

As noted in [CR97],

$$(3) \quad S = i^* R.$$

Also as noted in [CR97],

$$(4) \quad \frac{\partial R}{\partial l_{ij}} = \alpha_{ij},$$

and so

$$(5) \quad \frac{\partial^2 R}{\partial l_{ij} \partial l_{kl}} = \frac{\partial \alpha_{ij}}{\partial l_{kl}}.$$

- (b) Since simplices are infinitesimally rigid, the Hessian matrix of R is nonsingular in the hyperbolic case, and nonsingular when restricted to the cone $\sum_{i < j} l_{ij} = 1$, $l_{ij} > 0$ in the Euclidean case (the implication is given by Eq. (5).) In particular, the Hessian matrix is nonsingular when restricted to the image of i . By Eq. (3) and linearity of the map i , it follows that S is nonsingular (on the cone $\sum r_i = 1$, in the Euclidean case).

It follows that to check the convexity of S , we need only do it at one point. As pointed out above, the argument given in [CR97] works without modification for regular simplices, and so the convexity of S follows.

REFERENCES

- CR97. Daryl Cooper and Igor Rivin. *Combinatorial Scalar Curvature and Rigidity of Ball Packings*, Math. Res. Lett., **3**, no 1, pp 51-60.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, TEMPLE UNIVERSITY, PHILADELPHIA

Current address: Mathematics Department, Princeton University

E-mail address: rivin@math.temple.edu